Having been around long enough to remember when J. R. Smallwood was the ruling demagogue I have no hesitation in stating that the abuse of power and privilege which has surrounded the present Government's treatment of the Muskrat Falls hydroelectric proposal (the MFP) is among the worst, if not <u>the</u> worst, that I have seen. It is very easy for any rational individual to conclude that the Government has in fact been actively engaged in perpetrating a deception and fraud upon the electorate of the Province. And to make matters much worse they have steadfastly refused to offer any substantive answers to those questions which might have resolved the issue in their favor.

The key question has to be : "Why has there not been a thorough and independent analysis by a panel of acknowledged experts of all energy supply options that are open to the Province to the year 2041?"

The only answer offered in response is that Nalcor, which cannot be assumed to be an unbiased source of information, has considered all the options and has rejected those which it does not consider viable. As a result the only, and obviously non-expert, review of the proposal by the Public Utilities Board was restricted to a comparison of the MFP with only one alternative, the so-called "Isolated Island Scenario", which could very well be the worst possible alternative. This in turn is viewed by Government to obviate any need for anyone to provide any detailed and rational analysis of other alternatives. Indeed, on this date, which is the deadline for public submissions to the PUB review, the only arguments against the possibility of using natural gas have appeared in brief report by The Telegram of a presentation to the local Board of Trade by the CEO of Nalcor. Among other statements which appear therein is one which refers to the transportation of liquefied natural gas as "tricky", which statement presumably implies that there is nothing about the MFP that can be considered "tricky". It is on the basis of secondhand statements of this kind that we are apparently expected to accept the verdict with no further discussion. And we are left to wonder whether Nalcor did actually consider natural gas in any detail at an earlier date or whether they have they just cobbled together something at the last minute when no one has an opportunity to formally respond.

The next mode specific question is : "Why has there been no discussion of possibilities based on the assumption that the first priority should be to establish a link to the continental grid?"

The only response so far offered to this question is that the \$B6.2 MFP is required in order to justify the \$B1.2 maritime cable link notwithstanding various statements from Nalcor which indicate that the link is not actually required to justify the MFP. How one is expected to logically process this response can only be left to the imagination. On the other hand the existence of a maritime link would immediately answer Nalcor's only reason (so far expressed) for not considering large scale wind energy development on the Island. Namely, it would provide the required import/export buffer to compensate for the variability of wind energy conversion. The

present writer has elsewhere demonstrated that a wind farm with 824 MW MFP equivalent installed capacity can offer a firm generating capacity which is more cost effective than the MFP. This idea which is based on data provide by the MHI report to the PUB has been presented over the past two months to Gilbert Bennett of Nalcor and the Minister of Natural Resources by email but without response. It has been submitted to the Nalcor blog site on two occasions without being acknowledged or posted, and has finally been spent to the CEO by regular mail. One can only conclude there is no possible response which will justify the exclusion of this alternative.

There has been no satisfactory justification for excluding from consideration the sudden availability of over 5 MW of power from the Upper Churchill in 2041. This simply boggles the mind.

The pseudo-reasoning offered by Nalcor for not considering energy conservation as a means of reducing demand is simply unacceptable and flies in the face of all logic.

Finally there is the decision by the Government not to permit the peoples elected representatives an opportunity to seek the necessary answers in a timely manner by shutting the doors of the House of Assembly - most shameful and craven decision.

